

## Contents

### Introduction

- I. Participatory Care: Is it Pastoral Care?
- II. Joining Individual Narratives to Communal Narratives
- III. Transforming Emotions
- IV. Building Communities Across Boundaries of Difference
- V. Supporting Countercultural, Non-Market Values

## Introduction

“And whenever the evil spirit from God was upon Saul, David took the lyre and played it with his hand, so Saul was refreshed and the evil spirit departed from him.” (1 Samuel 16:23).

Care and music are closely related. Before the rise of the specialties of pastoral care and counseling in the 20<sup>th</sup> century, Christian communities participated in music making as a form of care, through singing, composing, and playing musical instruments. Most notably for those of us gathered at the Oxford Institute, Wesleyan hymn singing is a prime historical example in which music and care were integrated activities.

The pastoral care and counseling movement has paid little attention to the therapeutic effects of music. The re-emergence of participatory music making in post-modernity, and the ongoing presence of participatory music making in traditional communities, suggest that the time has come to pay explicit attention to the relationship between music and care. Does that mean incorporating music therapy into pastoral care and counseling? Although that innovation would be interesting, I am not advocating for pastoral music therapy. I am suggesting that participatory music making is important as *basic participatory care*.

Basic participatory care is part of what Robert Kegan called “natural therapy.” Reflection on *basic participatory care* is important. There is a fundamental level of care that is necessary to human existence for which we have little language or reflection in the contemporary discussion of pastoral care and counseling. Because we have had little language or reflection on this level of care, we tend to think of “counseling” as *the* therapeutic activity when other activities might be more appropriate.

### Basic, Participatory Pastoral Care

What is basic participatory care? I am referring to those activities in which people

participate to sustain their hope, their trust, their basic sense of life's goodness and the goodness of other people. Interdependent with this basic sense of hope might be their sense of God: of God's goodness, grace, and care for humanity. In that very fundamental way, music making communities in which basic, participatory care occurs contribute to "the new creation" in the Wesleyan sense -- the renewal of the image of God in human beings.

In traditional communities music making was part of the social and religious life of the community. From African villages to Irish pubs to rural community halls in North America, community music making was common in community life. Gathering with others for fun and celebration around music and the energy created by the music itself somehow provided community care. After the 20<sup>th</sup> century rise of psychological therapy in western culture, many of these kinds of communal activities diminished in North America. In some places, however, participatory music making is reemerging. And with it, people are discovering that music making is "therapeutic."

For example, In Rochester, New York, where I live, the following forms of participatory music making can be found:

- Golden Link, a sing around. Sitting in a circle, each participant leads a song or plays an instrumental tune in turn.
- New Horizons, a senior citizens' band and orchestra. People aged fifty and over, whether or not they have ever played an instrument, are invited to learn to play, practice together and perform.
- Multiple, regular open mikes. Signing up on a first come, first serve basis, amateur and professional musicians alike perform three songs each. Often the professionals "back-up" the amateurs, helping them sound their best.
- Irish and Appalachian sessions. These groups promote and sustain ethnic and regional traditions of participatory music.
- Summer music camps. Adults and children learn together in music day camp. The overnight version combines the instruction of day camp with the night life of the music festival.
- Multiple community choruses and orchestras, with and without auditions. (Congregational choirs, orchestras, and bands fall in this category). Groups practice pieces together, usually in preparation for community performances.

In these groups people sing and play traditional and newly composed music. The emphasis, however, is on participation; the result is community building and basic care.

Basic, participatory care, as I am talking about it, is foundational to human existence. It exists in the sociality of community life, in the interstices of communal activity. Until recently, those of us who have theorized about pastoral care could assume that the matrix of basic community care was in place. We could, therefore, emphasize the kind of concerns with which the pastoral care literature is replete: care of the sick and the poor, especially in institutions, and counseling people in life's transitions and crises, especially by pastors or other designated persons in congregations. As community life changes and people become more isolated from one another, the foundations are cracking. Basic care can no longer be taken for granted.

The idea of basic, participatory care is based on a set of assumptions that are beginning to emerge in recent thought about pastoral care. First, care is based on mutuality – not one person or expert who cares *for* another, but two or more persons whose relationship together creates care for all participants.<sup>1</sup> Second, care is communal – different aspects of care happen for us in different communities.<sup>2</sup> Third, care involves activities and practices, in addition to conversation.<sup>3</sup>

Most pastoral care and counseling theorists work within a model of pastoral conversation. My project builds on these authors yet is distinguished from them. Emphasis on *practices* has emerged strongly in the practical theology.<sup>4</sup> I am identifying and reflecting on a practice or activity that creates care at its most basic level – a level of care that we can no longer assume exists in everyday life.

## Basic Care and the Wesleyan Movement

Music making contributes to basic care. To develop this thesis, I suggest that there are four aspects of basic care and music making that help people maintain and enhance their well-being in today's world. First, the music making joins individual narratives to larger narratives with which the participant identifies. Second, the music making allows individuals to transform emotions such as grief and despair into emotions of joy and hope. Third, the music making helps people make friends across difficult boundaries such as age, ethnicity, and socioeconomic status. Fourth, the music making provides a support for a countercultural, non-market value system and experience. For each aspect of care, I will provide a vignette from a participatory musician in which we can “overhear” the way he or she thinks about that aspect of music and care, then explore in a limited way how that aspect of care has been addressed in the pastoral care literature or why it should be addressed in this literature. Finally, I will explore how the practices and theology in Wesleyan hymnody, particularly the theology of the new creation, helps illuminate these four aspects of care. The new creation, an idea that focuses on the growth of the image of God in human beings, is a powerful theological idea with which to explore the work of pastoral care, as Larry Graham and Leroy T. Howe have already shown.<sup>5</sup>

Before those questions can be explored, however, a question will be hovering in the room: on what grounds can these activities be related to pastoral care? How can theological reflection on secular music making be considered pastoral theology? Doesn't this work push the boundaries of what we call pastoral care, counseling, and theology too far?

### **I. Participatory Care: Is it *Pastoral Care*?**

Why study largely secular music making communities to learn about basic, participatory care? I was initially intrigued with music making communities as communities of care when I participated in a fiddle camp in 1993 in central Tennessee. The camp was open to anyone who wanted to come. When I arrived, I discovered that of the one hundred and fifty music making campers, about a hundred and twenty were music teachers, part time band members, and money-making musicians, about ten were child virtuosos from several countries, and about twenty were relative beginners like myself. Some read music; others learned by ear. The head music-making guru, Mark O'Connor, had developed a curriculum that was structured loosely but with

intention: we were to spend the first three days listening to the masters of five different fiddling styles, and the last two in intense lessons on two styles. When classes weren't in session, the Montgomery Bell State Park sounded like a recording studio, with pick-up groups playing everywhere.

As I observed and participated as best I could in the music making, I pondered the community that the music had formed: it acted more like the church than the church! No religious music was played but the community demonstrated relational values that the Christian gospel tries to instill. In fact, these values were practiced at a level few that congregations achieve. I experienced inclusivity, mutuality, respect, generosity, compassion, acceptance, forgiveness, and healthy limit setting – in short, grace! These were down home folk from just about every state in the nation, from very rural to metropolitan areas. They didn't want to gripe, complain or compete. They wanted to learn and to make music together. Everyone who wanted to play was welcome to listen or to play along at his or her level in pick-up groups. Music teachers and band members were eager to answer questions of beginners. More experienced members taught each other, sharing ideas, tunes, and techniques. My roommates (a band member and a music teacher) encouraged me to play along, making it clear that they could suffer my mistakes but not my excuses or anxieties. The joy and companionship I found at fiddle camp I rarely found in church or in conversational groups formed by professionals in pastoral care. The experience was simultaneously ethical and spiritual. The experience was pastoral care, though it was not “by the pastor” or explicitly religious.

One Meaning of Pastoral Care: Care “By the Pastor” and Other Religious Helping Professionals  
Care,” according to the Merriam Webster Dictionary, comes from the Old English *caru* and is, in most of its meanings, associated with grief, suffering, solicitation, and concern. This definition is reflected in the phrases commonly associated with 20<sup>th</sup> century pastoral care: pastoral care involves “solicitous concern” on the part of “set apart persons” who are involved with “healing, guiding, sustaining, reconciling”<sup>6</sup> and, more recently, “emancipatory liberation, justice-seeking, public advocacy, and ecological partnership.”<sup>7</sup> This definition of pastoral care reflects understandings that predate the 20<sup>th</sup> century but, under the influence of the organization of the helping professions in the 20<sup>th</sup> century, took a particular form. Pastoral care and counseling became increasingly associated with chaplaincy and clinical counseling that occurred in non-congregational settings. The models for care in congregations were then imported from other institutions back into the congregational setting. With these models came a peculiarity of the 20<sup>th</sup> century: the 20<sup>th</sup> century was more enamored with pathology than with health, so we have sought cures for preventable diseases rather than urging life practices that could promote wellness. Many persons argue that in a whole host of health care issues we have emphasized “cure” over “care.”<sup>8</sup> This cultural emphasis also influenced the development of the specialties of pastoral care and counseling. We became more concerned with pastoral cure than pastoral care. In the dynamics of 20<sup>th</sup> century ministry the person who offered pastoral cure was set-apart. He or she was not only “ordained,” but also “professional” and “expert.” Along with this model of expertise came a host of professional structures and expectations, drawn from other helping

professions, that tended to distance the pastor from the values that animate the gospel.

When *pastoral* implies professionalization of the pastor in such a way that the pastor resists pastoral values and attitudes, pastoral care and counseling becomes internally contradictory. The mutuality, interdependence and empowerment that ideally characterizes pastoral care can be replaced by dependence on the pastor or counselor. Furthermore, professionals can displace trusted persons in the community who have been the traditional caregivers. Pastoral *caregivers* can get in the way of pastoral *care*. Roy SteinhoffSmith, applying the insights of John McKnight<sup>9</sup> and others in community development to pastoral care and counseling, writes that “care is not what experts do but what all of us do.”<sup>10</sup> He asserts with McKnight that the rise of the expert helping professions has contributed to the devaluation of non-professionals’ role in care. McKnight charges that helping professionals have a vested interest in creating a population dependent upon them. When the care “we all do” is devalued, then the wise and trusted community persons who do not have expert credentials are delegitimized. When these leaders are replaced by “experts,” communities lose their vitality.

A historical view suggests that there is wisdom in this criticism, but also that the professionalized practices have a necessary place. The helping professions, including 20<sup>th</sup> century versions of pastoral care and counseling, arose in part from the professionalization of what had been “women’s work.”<sup>11</sup> On one hand, the professionalization of care in psychology and social work may have diminished women’s former sense of confidence and expertise in the areas of family and child care. It may have diminished the mentorship of women by women who are friends and companions, in favor of the mentorship of women by experts. On the other hand, women in the settlement house movement argued that local congregations and organizations could not respond alone to the overwhelming needs of poor populations. The women argued that the church, government, and private agencies needed to be partners in care for the relief of persons and families who were suffering. Though their dialogue is at times marked with the condescension and power-over dynamics that SteinhoffSmith rightly criticizes, their general thrust toward the need for shared responsibility for care was correct. We have had far too little reflection on what this shared responsibility means and how it extends to all of us. While there is much need to promote neighbors helping neighbors, there is also much need for specialists who can work in the extremities of distress. So, the argument I am making here is not intended to suggest that pastoral counselors, chaplains, and training for pastors in parish care and counseling is unneeded. I am simply trying to shine a light on the centrality of care that occurs in participatory activity, and the ways in which that care is “pastoral.” It is this basic care that is augmented by pastors, chaplains, and pastoral counselors. We are badly in need of reflection on “the care that all of us do” and how that care can be supported. In part, that care occurs in participatory music making.

#### Another Meaning of Pastoral Care: Care “We All Do”

“Care,” according to the Merriam Webster Dictionary, is also associated with the idea of support or maintenance, related to the Old French term *maintenir*. In the United States we are now experiencing a cultural change in which people are actively concerned with maintaining and enhancing well being, rather than simply curing disease. In the same way, pastoral *care* involves both the maintenance and empowerment of persons and communities, in addition to attending to

them in times of suffering.

Living out a set of qualities is directly related to care. The idea that “pastoral” refers to an attitude that embodies a set of qualities is well accepted. “Designating this care as pastoral may refer either to the person of the religious leader or to the motivation/attitude characterizing the caregiver,” according to the entry “Pastoral Care” in the *Dictionary of Pastoral Care*.<sup>12</sup> Being pastoral suggests a way of being in the world, an attitude of being present in the midst of routine and being receptive to people in joy and difficulty. One who is pastoral embodies those values I experienced at fiddle camp. One does not need to be a pastor to exhibit these qualities. In fact, laity can be “pastoral” when pastors are not. But where does the association of qualities with pastoral care come from?

“Pastoral,” in its dominant dictionary meaning, is related to shepherds or country people, agricultural lifestyles, the countryside, and the folk, especially when such lifestyles are idealized in a pleasingly peaceful and innocent manner. It is related to the deep wisdom and peace that can be found by living in harmony with natural environs. It is secondarily related to pastors and spiritual care. It became associated with pastoral care because Biblical imagery so often draws on agricultural imagery.

The association of pastoral care with “shepherding” was promoted by Seward Hiltner but received much criticism in recent years. The critics say that the image of the relationship of shepherd and sheep, when applied to pastor and congregation, promotes the power of the pastor over the congregants. In Riet Bons-Storm’s study of women in the Women and Faith Movement of the Netherlands who do not feel that pastors have adequately listened to them, one woman says that the image promotes the idea that the clergy/shepherds know what’s best for the congregants/flock. She says, “It entails a hidden agenda of the pastor: to bring the sheep back to the congregation in the first place, often without giving real attention to personal problems and the injustices that underlie them.”<sup>13</sup> Other women are adamant: the shepherd/sheep image is not useful to them. The criticism captures a problem with the image as it is frequently used.

The shepherding/sheep image is no more essential to the identity of a person who understands him or herself to be in pastoral care than any other image. Rather, it is one possible image that may contribute to our self-understanding. For those who do use this image, it is important to recognize that the image carries with it the connotations of the trusted community leader that is often dismissed by experts. For those who need to abandon this image, I suggest that reflection on the image of Friend, often used in Wesleyan hymnody, might be an alternative. However, I feel it is incumbent on me to interpret this image. It is central to agricultural images of pastoral care. It is an image that is frequently used in Wesleyan hymnody. Therefore, the image must be explored in order to test the viability of Wesleyan theology and the new creation for basic, participatory care.

What is Shepherding: Care the Pastor Does, or Care “We All Do”?

The metaphor of pastor as shepherd is based on the idea that the relationship of pastor to congregation is like the relationship of Christ and the church. The pastor as shepherd seeks to lead the congregation with the actions and qualities that imitate Christ. These actions are wide-ranging. For example, Wesleyan hymnody, according to *A Collection of Hymns for the use of the People Called Methodists*,<sup>14</sup> suggests a wide range of activities that God through Jesus Christ, as

Shepherd, engages in. God seeks wandering sheep (Hymn 13); hears pleas for assistance on behalf of those who are lost (Hymn 80); enfolds the weary wanderer into the arms of mercy (Hymn 170); pities, cares tenderly, guides, nourishes, keeps, and loves the sheep into wholeness (Hymns 176, 186); dies for the sheep (Hymn 421); receives all the sheep into his fold and unifies them (Hymn 436); gathers souls that depart (Hymn 447); protects, keep them in love and harmony, and fulfills the work of faith (Hymn 487). These kinds of seeking, protecting, guiding, loving, and unifying images have traditionally been associated with the pastor as a shepherd. In these actions, the pastor as shepherd seeks to fulfill a vocation in which Christ-like qualities, such as love and tenderness, have taken root in him or her. Still, the activities of the shepherd revealed through Wesleyan hymnody need to be criticized for their excesses, as Bon-Storm and the Women and Faith Movement have done.

But do all Christians, not just pastors, have a vocation of Christ-like action that is communicated by the Biblical imagery of the shepherd? In a hymn not written by the Wesleys but often sung in Wesleyan churches, “I sing a song of the saints of God,” the lyrics of the first verse reads:

I sing a song of the saints of God,  
patient and brave and true,  
who toiled and fought and lived and died  
for the Lord they loved and knew.  
And one was a doctor, and one was a queen,  
and one was a shepherdess on the green;  
they were all of them saints of God,  
and I mean, God helping to be one, too.<sup>15</sup>

The three saints in this verse are lay persons from very different places in the social order: the doctor is a professional, the queen is an aristocrat, and the shepherdess is a farmer. Of the three the shepherdess is the one with the least status according to worldly standards. The song continues, making the point that the saints of God are very ordinary people. The shepherdess is “on the green,” in the pasture with the sheep. She is not the CEO of a corporate agribusiness; rather, she seeks the well-being of the sheep in their own habitat where they flourish.

The shepherd is a shepherdess, a woman! Lesbia Scott’s 1929 lyrics are revealing today, for in the United States more women than men are farmers, especially on small farms. Shepherding has much in common with what is traditionally called “women’s work.” According to Marie Rose O’Reilly’s *The Barn at the End of the World: The Apprenticeship of a Quaker, Buddhist Shepherd*, the shepherdess on a university sheep farm in Minnesota still searches for lost sheep. But she also does much more: she functions as midwife, cook, doctor, shearer, toilet cleaner, and undertaker for the sheep.<sup>16</sup> Above all, she must be comfortable *in* a wide variety of bodily discharges. In order to learn this wide range of tasks, she must *practice*. Her entire body is physically involved, even as her spirit seeks a necessary calm and contemplation. She loves her sheep and she lets them go. Being a shepherdess is undomesticated, down and dirty work, work that is conducted as hygienically as possible but still dangerous to the shepherdess’ health. It is

work that would be unappealing to the majority of us. This kind of pastoral shepherd would hardly be a detached, status oriented, professionalized pastor-CEO, but rather one who loves the intimate, risky, respectful, physical practice of shepherding. The willingness to engage in specific practices and qualities that enhance the well-being of others gives the shepherdess her identity. The practices and qualities of the shepherd may be found in the experienced professional or in the English professor turned shepherdess-apprentice.

In fact, if we insert “God as Mother” into list of shepherding activities that are drawn from Wesleyan hymnody, we might imagine how much “women’s work” is involved: God seeks wanderers; hears pleas for assistance; enfolds the weary wanderer into the arms of mercy; pities, cares tenderly, guides, nourishes, keeps, and loves into wholeness; dies for the ones she loves; receives all the ones she loves and unifies them; prays for the ones who die; protects, keeps them in love and harmony, and fulfills the work of faith. And, in many families today, what has been traditionally associated with women’s work has become everyone’s work. This work is the Christian’s work. If we identify with Christ the Shepherd as a model for our vocation, might we use the metaphor to think of our work first as Christians, then secondarily as pastors?

#### The Flock: Dumb or Vulnerable?

Imagined this way, the problem with the “shepherd/sheep” metaphor has more to do with the idea of congregants as “flock” than with Christians as shepherds. Sheep are reputed to be dumb animals, so that the equation of sheep with members of congregations, especially when contrasted with pastors as shepherds, is offensive. But, should sheep be considered dumb, or vulnerable?

My daughter, who in the course of her degree in agriculture at the University of Georgia interned with sheep, characterized the flock in this way: “Yes, sheep occasionally wander and get lost but the real problem with sheep is that they crowd one another and suffocate each other when they are frightened. Part of the shepherd’s job is to make sure the sheep are giving each other enough space. A bigger danger to sheep in the modern world is human beings, however. Animals’ rights activists feel so strongly that sheep need to be “free” or “cage-free” that they have been known to open gates to let them out in the middle of the night. While this may seem to be an act of kindness, what they don’t realize is that sheep don’t understand they can be hurt and will wander into the road and get hit by cars.”

Sheep, like humans, negotiate boundaries of isolation and closeness. They need some assistance in doing so, just as the shepherdess may need assistance negotiating her own boundaries. Human beings, whether they are activists or persons in agribusiness, exercising the best of their diverse and finite wisdom, can be the flock’s worst enemy, just as human beings are often the worst enemies of other humans. In addition to death from human exploitation, sheep have a high rate of premature death from disease, as do human beings in many parts of the world. The flock, it seems, is vulnerable to its own practices and to the practices of those on the outside, and would be even more fragile if it weren’t for the shepherdess’s best but finite care.

#### Pastoral Care: Participating in Christ-likeness

The imagery of shepherd and sheep are associated with pastoral care, in part, because it communicates that engagement in pastoral care involves engagement in seeking to be Christ-like.

In Wesleyan hymnody Christians are referred to as flock, sheep, and lambs. But Christians are not the only lambs -- Lamb is by far the most frequently used christological title for Christ. The metaphor Lamb, rather than Shepherd, is rarely retrieved as an image of the pastor or Christian in positive ways.<sup>17</sup> Christ as the Lamb emphasizes images of vulnerability and sacrifice. In Wesleyan hymnody the Lamb specifically refers to the atoning work of Christ. On one hand, Wesleyan theology considers Christ's sacrifice to be unique, so that the Christian cannot fully identify with Christ as Lamb. On the other hand, Wesleyan theology, specifically the idea of the new creation, considers the Christian to be a participant in the atoning work of Christ. The transformation that occurs in the new creation is in part a result of Christ's atonement.<sup>18</sup>

The idea of Christ as Shepherd/Lamb provides some paradoxical images for the pastoral Christian. First, the vulnerability of Jesus as Lamb *is* like the vulnerability that happens in any pastoral care. Jesus is portrayed as both Shepherd and Lamb, meaning that he is both protective and vulnerable. Second, the ability to engage in role reversals – for example, the reversal between the Shepherd and the Lamb – is central to genuine mutuality. Just as Christ is imaged as both Shepherd and Lamb, we are shepherds and lambs with one another at different times in different ways in our lives. Such mutuality is central the kind of basic, participatory pastoral care that I will describe.

Persons who seek a more mutual, egalitarian metaphor for the activity of pastoral care frequently use the metaphor “friend.” A central activity of pastoral care is “befriending.” Wesleyan hymnody uses the christological title “Friend” as frequently as it uses the title “Shepherd.”<sup>19</sup> “Friend” is as Biblical a christological title as “Shepherd.” Jesus as Friend still carries a central association with the atonement – Jesus is the Friend of sinners, the Friend who laid down his life for his Friends. In this way Charles Wesley is communicating something about the person of Jesus as Friend that overlaps with Jesus as Lamb. In significant ways, however, the metaphor of Jesus as Friend extends the image of what Jesus does. In the variety of images of Jesus as Friend, Charles Wesley communicates a full-bodied Friendship. Most frequently, Jesus as Friend goes places that respectable people will not go and eats with those who are despised – “publicans and sinners” – (Hymns 31, 106, 107, 128, 138, 187). Jesus as Friend also cures the lame, halt, blind/deaf, sick and poor (Hymn 31), clears the debt of sinners (Hymns 106, 139), hears human pain and comforts tenderly (Hymn 107), aids the lost and undone, who are weary of earth, self, and sin (Hymn 128), offers a strong arm to the sinner to hold toward eternal life (Hymn 138), sheds blood for sinners, inspires and accepts prayers (Hymn 303), provides safety from harm (Hymn 395), sees the havoc of creatures (Hymn 430), is a universal Friend – a friend to all (Hymns 430, 440). The title Friend is associated with a series of other titles that communicate the deep kinship and intimacy of divine and human friendship: Friend and Advocate (Hymn 139); Savior, Brother, Friend (Hymn 303); and Maker and Friend (Hymn 395). The title Friend gathers up a number of images of pastoral care, in addition to suggesting that the person who is pastoral associates with those who do not have status and prestige.

Friendship is a lens that complements the way we imagine relationships that are pastoral. It is dependent on the broad definition of the use of the word pastoral as “something we all do.” It seeks to mirror human participation in divine Friendship, but as with the image of “Shepherd,” it is a partial and finite metaphor for an infinite reality. Unlike divine Friendship, human friendship of any kind has necessary interpersonal boundaries and limits. In every human

friendship, reflection on both the possibilities and the limits of that friendship is important. Pastoral friendship that is modeled after Jesus as Friend, however, transcends artificial boundaries to reach out to all people, to care with people in their distress, and to support their intimacy with God. In making music together, we become friends – an earthly, penultimate image of participation in divine Friendship.

### The Musical Shepherd/ess, Friend, and the New Creation

The new creation, the result of God's grace and our cooperation with it, so that we are transformed into the image and likeness of God, is not the pastor's work: it is pastoral work that everybody does. The image of who we are when we are newly created may be glimpsed by the finite images of christological titles such as Shepherd, Lamb and Friend. These images suggest a pastoral care that is centered on the wisdom that is wrought in experience, in practice, in menial work, in responsibility and vulnerability, in participation in the most basic processes of life – a place where participatory music enters. In these hidden ordinary places in life, participatory music can be found, contributing to recreation.

## **II. Joining Individual Narratives to Communal Narratives**

In 20<sup>th</sup> century pastoral care and counseling it has become well accepted that we create the sense of who we are through joining personal and communal narratives.<sup>20</sup> In pastoral care and counseling, however, we have overlooked the way that music making is a significant part of our interpretation of ourselves. Songs that have actual lyrics, and stories about instrumental music and tunes, articulate a musical version of our individual and communal narratives. We also tell our story by the values that are enacted in our singing and the actual, embodied practices of music making. This idea can be demonstrated both by a contemporary example of music making in a small village in Nova Scotia and by the hymnody of the 18<sup>th</sup> century Wesleyan revival.

### A Musical Revival in Cheticamp: Participatory Stories, Values, and Practices

In Cheticamp, Nova Scotia, a small Acadian fishing village on the island of Cape Breton, Clarence Deveau<sup>21</sup> has his headphones on, listening, his fish and chips spread out on waxed paper in front of him. Clarence is the local songcatcher. In the recording studio in the basement of the cultural center, Clarence records the French, Gaelic, and Scottish music of Cheticamp -- music that almost died out. But Clarence is not primarily an ethnomusicologist or an archivist. Rather, he is a professional musician who seeks to empower amateur musicians who sing and play the local music of the past, as captured in the present, to invigorate the music of the future. The meaning he has constructed around his role in the revival of music making in Cheticamp, and the communal narrative that is emerging from this meaning making, demonstrates the parallels between the construction of narrative in pastoral care and music making.

The recording studio is run by a radio station that is part of a network that connects rural

communities in Canada during the isolating winter months. Part of the radio station's mission is to encourage and broadcast local music. Clarence, a native of Cheticamp and a guitarist who spent many years in Nashville as a session musician, is what Wayne Booth calls a pro-amateur – the kind of professional musician who makes amateurs feel good about making music.<sup>22</sup> He encourages old timers and young persons to record their music, teach each other songs, and recapture the a traditional of playing music together that had almost died out. For Clarence, encouraging local music is a way of helping the community know its past, its present and its future:

The people who have come here are from very young. . . to – I think the oldest one was eighty seven. . . . I did a hundred and fifty songs with this one gentleman who's approaching eighty last winter. . . .they were sung acapella with the old man tapping his feet. That's it. That's all he wanted. And that's fine. So before the song he tells a little story about where he got this song and who from and where he thinks they got it from, where he was when he first heard it, and then ambles on to the next and the next and the next. . . .We've done a lot of songs that we all thought were going to be lost if we didn't get recorded. Unfortunately, we've lost some of those. And along with them I've lost part of the community, *what we are, what we're all about, and where we want to go.*

### Hopeful, Future Stories

Although many theorists in pastoral care have developed aspects of this idea of narrative and meaning making, Andrew D. Lester's emphasis is particularly important to the kind of story that is unfolding in Cheticamp. In the book *Hope in Pastoral Care and Counseling* Lester argues that the narratives of the past, the present, and the future are equally important.<sup>23</sup> If the people of Cheticamp define themselves by telling a story of a romantic past, when cod was plentiful and music abounded, and if they conclude that self-definition with regret that those conditions no longer exist, they have diminished narrative that will not function toward a hopeful future. We see hints of such diminishment in Clarence's story:

I was still trying to go back and forth (between Cheticamp and Nashville), and I was under the impression that it wasn't worth building a studio in Cheticamp – after all we're in Cheticamp!. . . I'd say ten years ago, if anybody had talked in Cheticamp about this guy writing a song, (that) would have been really, really (laughed at)...cuz people here don't do that. People in Nashville do that. People in Toronto do that, write songs and record them, but no, no, we can't do that. . . .(Now, we get together to play and sing old songs and newly composed songs). . . it's one of those things that people didn't want to be part of at first and said it would never work. And said, where do you think you are? You're in Cheticamp.

Lester makes the point that the loss of the future narrative contributes to despair.<sup>24</sup> I will add that values are embedded in narratives. When we lose future narratives, we also lose the capacity to take into the future values we hold dear that help to sustain our trust in interpreting

life as worthwhile. We need a set of selected values that are brought from the past into the present and projected into the future – values that ground the individual and communal sense self. For Clarence, personally and in his experience of Cheticamp, values are emerging in the new music making: values of hospitality (“making people comfortable”), of mutuality, of honesty, of “being real,” and of sharing. They are the values Clarence experienced as a youth:

When I grew up, there were always houses at, whatever time of the day, you could go to these houses, there was instruments around, you’d pick one up. Someone else would walk in, pick another one up, then eventually, you’d get fed, and eventually it’s like, well it’s time for you to go to bed, you’ve got school tomorrow. And you could do that any night of the week but it got lost with the satellite dishes and computers – sort of, as the world is getting smaller, a lot of things are getting endangered.

### Values and Practices: Hospitality, Mutuality, Honesty and Sharing

Clarence says such hospitable values were lost in the world of the professional musician, where music was constantly evaluated for its marketability. As local people in Cheticamp began to make music again, playing the old tunes and composing new ones, Clarence re-experienced these values:

these are people who have never been involved in the industry, (who are) doing things for the right reasons and it comes from the right place and it moves you like I think music is supposed to do. You hear it and it brings you into their world or into part of your world that you don’t visit everyday. And it’s a very pleasant experience, whether it makes you sad or happy or. . . I’ve done my living as a session musician, touring, and those moments are rare for me. . . . almost every time somebody is in here I feel those moments.

By claiming their past, in the present, Clarence and the musicians of Cheticamp are becoming expectant about their future:

this stuff gives me the ok that it’s worth doing, because there are actually people who will keep this going. It might be a small majority (sic) of people, but it has a part to do with again who we are and what we’re all about. And there are going to be a small majority of people who are going to keep that alive. Everybody’s going to benefit from that.

The words of the narrative are not the whole story. The values embedded in the story, and the practices that are enacted as the story is told, will confirm or challenge the narrative.

### Therapeutic Narratives, Values, and Practices

In *Narrative Therapy in Practice: The Archeology of Hope*, Wendy Drewery and John Winslade describe the philosophical underpinnings of narrative therapy that theorists such as Lester have adapted for pastoral care and counseling.<sup>25</sup> Drewery and Winslade describe the

relationship between a narrative, the values it contains, and the practices that enact the narrative and its values. Analyzing these three parts, we quickly see how different narrative therapy is from what we often associate with pastoral counseling. The practice of pastoral counseling is often shaped by a medical model. The “client” who is suffering confers with the expert counselor whose job it is to produce a diagnosis of pathology, a treatment plan, and therapeutic goals. In contrast, Drewery and Winslade reject most of the terms just used: client, expert counselor, diagnosis, pathology, treatment. They might accept therapeutic goals that the person seeking help develops with the therapist as a consultant.

The primary value narrative therapists seek to uphold is respect: respectful listening and speaking, respect for the authority that people have over their own lives, and respect for people’s right to construct the narrative that interprets their lives. What they describe communicates what I could call hospitality: the conversation of therapy is always under scrutiny to determine where it may be unintentionally disrespectful. I would also call it mutuality: a person’s narrative is always their own story or a shared story created by two or more participants in the story. I would also call it honesty: honesty searches for hidden interpretations that need to be drawn out, in order to create hopeful narratives. Out of this value stance, narrative therapists have become uncomfortable with premises of therapy that assume expert knowledge on the part of the therapist that overrides the self-knowledge of the person seeking help, with diagnostic labelling, and with the individualism and essentialism that is assumed within much developmental psychology. They are uncomfortable with practices such as diagnosis and referrals that create a story about a person that the person never sees or amends.

In contrast, they assume that the way people organize meaning arises from the contexts of their lives, within which they gain their own “voice”. Their voice enables them to gain the power to take a place, the position, within their own lives that they desire, rather than being “positioned” by others. In so doing, they retain their authority over their own narrative. From that place they can enter into shared narratives – creating shared meanings – with others with whom they interact. The therapeutic practices that support these understandings include helping a person gain his or her voice and agency, deconstructing disabling narratives that keep people in positions of suffering, creating externalizing conversations that move problems outside oneself, and identifying hopeful narratives that lurk within the “positioned” narratives.

My hunch is that whenever and wherever these values are maintained and undergirded by practices that embody them, a therapeutic environment exists. The theory of therapy is less important than the whether these such values are exercised within the therapy. And the environments of participatory music making are frequently places where such values and practices are sustained.

For example, in his narrative of the revival of music making in Cheticamp, Clarence was careful to be sure that the designer of the recording studio created an environment that was hospitable to amateurs. He sought to create “voice” in their music making: he suggested getting together to make music, let the ideas germinate, and waited till the townspeople were ready to pick up their instruments. In so waiting, he empowered their own willingness to try something new. The growth of the music group around the recording studio becomes a shared story. He invites all music -- the French, the Scottish, and the Gaelic, despite the notorious conflict between the anglophone and francophones in eastern Canada. He is thrilled to discover the

intergenerational respect for musicianship between an elderly musician and a teenager. He urges people to teach each other the old songs, but also supports contests for new composers, again, supporting the emerging musical voice.

These values are practiced in the music making group itself. The evening of the day I interviewed Clarence, I found myself on an unlit road, making unmarked turns in rural Cape Breton, searching for a community center. When I entered with my fiddle, I saw an inner circle of chairs in which twenty-five musicians sat with their instruments. Behind them, the hall was filled with folding chairs on either side where listeners and observers sat. Each participant, no matter how proficient a musician or how elementary, introduced or led a tune. Each announced the song or tune, told a story of a few lines about it, and began to play on the instrument he or she brought – that night guitars were plentiful, fiddles were a few, and one man strummed a mean dow brow. A standing mike was passed from leader to leader, so that all could hear the introductions and the lead. First I tried to sit in the audience and listen, but since I announced myself to be a musician by walking in with a fiddle case, the men (all of the musicians were men that night, though women are members) pushed back their chairs, laughed and smiled me into the circle, and welcomed the newcomer from New York. The audience (men and women) chatted and welcomed my husband. The evening proceeded with much the same ritual of Golden Link, the sing along that has been singing for thirty years on Tuesday nights in Rochester.

The musical group and the recording studio clearly have made a difference in the way that at least one musician of Cheticamp has gained his voice and imagined a hopeful future. I am left wondering, how does it shape the lives of participants of a musical group who, week after week, engage in such an egalitarian, mutual, sharing ritual? How does this kind of actual practice of music making support the participatory values that animate Clarence in the recording studio? These questions are beyond the scope of this paper but will be explored in the next phase of this work.

## A Musical Revival and the Wesleyan Movement

The hymn singing of the Wesleyan movement served not only liturgical purposes but also doubled as a significant form of participatory pastoral care. It concerned itself overtly with narrative and practices, but more obliquely with values.

### *The Collection of Hymns (1780)*

The *Collection of Hymns (1780)* represents a Wesleyan version of the communal Christian narrative to which an individual could join his or her faith story. The Christian narrative has a basic outline, but within that outline, the variations on telling that story are significant. Hymnbooks usually develop the story by following the liturgical year through the life of Jesus Christ and the gathering of the church. The story told in this hymnbook, in contrast, is “the spiritual biography of a real Christian,” according to Bernard Manning.<sup>26</sup> It begins with the goodness of God and develops through the spiritual quickening, maturation, and communal life of the Wesleyan Christian. The 525 hymns are organized in five parts: Part I invites the unconverted to entertain the idea of the goodness of God; Part II describes formal and inward

religion; Part III describes repentance, backsliding and recovery; Part IV attends to the growing life of the believer; Part V sings the life of the Society. Parts I-III are oriented more toward describing religious experience, and Parts IV-V sing the believer through various practices of mature religious experience. Throughout, the primary value the *Collection of Hymns (1780)* extolls is not interpersonal but between the believer and God. It seeks to inspire and sustain the faith of people. It recognizes that people at different stages of faith need different kinds of inspiration.

The hymnbook represents a particular version within the Wesleyan narrative. Franz Hildebrandt notes that though the hymns were primarily written by Charles, they were carefully edited and authorized by John.<sup>27</sup> The drafts of the hymnbook show that at times the brothers differed over individual words that express differences in theology and temperament. When John writes, the language is more reasoned; when Charles writes, more intimate and sensual. Their use of christological titles is an example of this difference. Both John and Charles would endorse the idea of Jesus as Shepherd or Friend, since both of those titles are scriptural. Charles, however, uses these terms of address more frequently in his hymns than John does in his sermons.

Among the theologies of the time, the Wesleyan Christian story distinctively emphasized the goodness of God, sanctification, renewal and transformation of the human in the image of God. This transformation – what is sometimes called the new creation – is especially prominent within the more mature stages of the development of faith. The new creation is referred to in a number of hymns but is most prominent in Part IV, Sections III-VIII. In these sections the practices of religious experience are most prominent: “For Believers Praying, Watching, Working, Suffering, Groaning for full Redemption, Brought to the New Birth.” In these sections the renewal of the image of God in the Christian is a constant theme. The point of the new creation in these hymns is one way of stating the point of pastoral care: to help Christians find Godliness in their hearts and to perfect Christians in their ability to love. Wesleyan pastoral care offers this message with a peculiar emphasis: care particularly seeks to help an individual cooperate with the grace of God so as to expand the image of God within the person.

The numbers that swelled the ranks of the Wesleyan movement are a testimony to the appeal in the 18<sup>th</sup> century of the Wesleyan version of the Christian narrative. For people who valued religious education, the hymnbook served as a primary teaching device. People learned what to expect of their religion as they sang it! A method that combines devotion, religious education, and care raises several questions, however. Teaching the expected Christian experience by singing one’s way through the religious life cycle is a major change from teaching the life of Jesus by singing one’s way through the liturgical year. Did people conform their internal emotional experience to match the experience of the Wesleys, as recorded in the hymnbook? Were words placed in people’s hands to be sung about a spiritual experience with which some people did not identify? If they were still expected to sing, did what Elaine Ramshaw calls “ritual dishonesty” result?<sup>28</sup> What room was there for the people’s own “voice” of faith, their agency, their self-understanding?

Since John compiled hymns in the *Collection of Hymns (1780)* that the societies were singing, the societies as a whole had a *de facto* role in shaping the “spiritual biography” using the materials, Charles’ poetry, that they were given. Some hymns were obviously more popular in

the societies than others. In that sense there was some reciprocity between the brothers Wesley and the participants in the societies, as they constructed their story of the religious experience. The fact that this theology was popularly sung suggests that people recognized in it something authentic about what they expected their religious experience to be.

Music is one of the tools through which people make meaning in their lives. In Cheticamp people are reconstructing their personal and communal narratives through music. In that situation, the narrative was also supported by distinct practices and values that helped to communicate the narrative. Pastoral care suggests a further step: that religious meaning making happens when people identify the places where their own narrative intersects with the Christian narrative. Practices support the narrative; values may be communicated within those practices. The *Collection of Hymns (1780)* provided a particularly useful vehicle for accomplishing the narrative goal of pastoral care through music.

### III. Transforming Emotions

What are emotions? Emotions are a complex mixture of affect, or changes in physiological states, with or without awareness; feeling, or awareness of affect; and the personal memories and associations that become attached to affect and feelings.<sup>29</sup> A primary goal of pastoral care is to help people transform emotional states in which they suffer into emotional states in which they feel at peace or even hopeful. Creating and recreating narratives set the stage for transforming emotions. In the last section we saw that music participated in interpreting experience and, thereby, creating narratives; in this section we will explore how, just as music and pastoral care are different means to a similar end of joining individual and communal narratives, music and pastoral care have common transformative effects on our emotional life. The Wesleys were fully aware of the transformative power of music and intentionally used music toward this end of pastoral care.

Because the literature on emotions in counseling and music is immense, I will limit my discussion to transformation toward hope. In 20<sup>th</sup> century pastoral care there has been a revival of interest in creating hope as a focus of pastoral care. In recent years we have seen the publication of such books as James Dittes' *Driven by Hope: Men and Meaning*, Don Capps' *Agents of Hope*, Andrew Lester's *Hope in Pastoral Care and Counseling*, and Susan Dunlap's *Counseling Depressed Women*, all of which discuss hope.<sup>30</sup> The focus on hope contrasts significantly with earlier emphases that focus more on pathology and intrapsychic processes or dysfunction and family systems. These emphases focused more on understanding deficits and at times lacked a positive goal toward which transformation needed to occur.

Even though the focus of the writing in pastoral care and counseling has only recently focused on hope, there has been an underlying assumption in the therapeutic literature that the transformation of emotion is a significant goal toward which therapy works. This goal, however, is achieved by people in many different ways. The power of music to transform the emotions has been widely discussed in philosophical literature; it is recognized in "alternative" therapies

such as music therapy. And, it was recognized by the Wesleys.

### Emotional Transformation in Rochester: Loneliness to Connection

When I have talked casually with people about participatory music making, participants frequently comment, “It’s therapeutic! It’s good for my mental health.” Mitzie Collins,<sup>31</sup> a former classical musician who became a leader in participatory, community music in Rochester, explains that she got into leading community groups in music as a result of her own loneliness after a divorce. Looking back on her experience, and thinking of the social isolation she sees in young adults today, she says of music and dancing,

Mitzie: . . . I think it is self-healing. And also there are a lot of tremendously lonesome people there. I say lonesome people, kind of alone people. It’s very hard in our society to be in your 20s and meet people. Where do you go?

She first experienced the folk mass when her husband, a seminary student, and a college classmate, whose mother ran a record company, recorded a folk mass. After her divorce she became music director at St. Ambrose Church,<sup>32</sup> when the folk music craze was in full bloom. Leading folk masses at St. Ambrose, she discovered that she could communicate better through folk music than through classical music. She recalls,

Mitzie: And I had my hair long and black and parted in the middle and I was going through this guitar thing, and I began becoming aware of the melody, of the shape of a melody, and then, I got into singing unaccompanied songs, and that was really a revelation, here was this melody, just all by itself and how wonderful that was. Because with piano you get *ten notes*. And at the same time here is an unaccompanied melody. And that was really profound. That was just wonderful feeling of singing the melody. . . .

Pam: Do you have any sense of what was so wonderful about that?

Mitzie: Well, it was the shape of the tune, and ... it didn’t need any harmony, it made it’s own harmony. And so it’s back to an earlier ... kind of system where the western harmony of the hymnody and harmonizing every note. It’s a much earlier kind of feeling.

Pam: So you actually had the experience yourself of what Wesley talked about, of that melody being so transformative. . . .

Mitzie: Definitely, and .... a transforming idea of folk music early on to me was singing unaccompanied. And group singing unaccompanied. And for about 16 years we went to a folk music camp call Pine Wood and did a lot of group singing there, and dancing. And that was therapeutic. Dancing! Dancing is much better than therapy.

At this point in the interview, Mitzie turned to her husband, Tom:

Mitzie: English dancing, you should say about people looking at each other. Because in American square dancing you don't have to look at each other. But in English dancing you must look at your partner. . . .

Tom: : It's bodily contact without touching. Especially the historic English dancing there's no touching, maybe finger tips to finger tips, but there's a definite non-material contact that's made if people are dancing properly. It's couple dancing within sets, two three four couples, then eventually couples are dancing, and it's a progressive type of thing where couples dance with other couple and move up and down the row. But within the couple there's this feeling of, we are a unit, we are moving as a unit, we are thinking as a unit, we are feeling as a unit. And unlike what western square dancing has become, it is, the dancers are more at one with the music. Western square dancers are only using the music to sort of establish a beat, no concept of phrase, no concept of contour of music, but in English dancing, the earliest published source we have is 1651, which is probably a collection of long before that. Um, where the dance definitely is attuned to the music and the contour of the dance when properly done matches the contour of the music. And the dancer can incorporate this and feel this and express this. . . . And since many of the dance tunes were originally sung you are in some cases embodying the text of the song. . . .

Notice, then, the verbal dance that develops between Mitzie and Tom:

Mitzie: And in folk dancing and in English dancing even, there's a tremendous amount of discussion about authenticity, correctness,

Tom: interpreting from primary sources vs. interpreting from secondary sources.

Mitzie: And some people like, we're just doing it in the moment doesn't matter, any old which way, and some people saying, any old which way you miss the whole point of the dancing. . . . I mean in English dancing there's a couple of figures, one in particular, you call it gypsy, where two people stand like this

Tom: face to face without making contact. And they move around each other.

Mitzie: and they look at each other.

Tom: not turning their eyes from each other.

Mitzie: It is one of the most sexy things in the world. And in a world in which people never look at anybody, I mean, my God, you can go through a whole week where everyday, you go to a camp and you look at somebody when you dance with them, uh, it's incredible.

Mitzie was the interviewee; Tom was cooking and serving lunch. Tom was attentive and supportive, staying out of the way of the interview. This part of the conversation was unique, however; the move from Mitzie speaking in isolation to the connectedness of the couple became inscribed in the conversation about the music and dance. The emotional transformation from loneliness and social isolation to intimacy and connection was filled with energy and hope.

### Pastoral Care and the Transformation of Emotions

Though much could be said about the transformation of emotions in pastoral care, for the sake of time and space I will focus on transformation toward hope. For Capps, transformation toward hope involves “reframing” the interpretation of the past and the present in light of contexts within which events might occur.<sup>33</sup> For Lester, reimagining the future involves both finite and infinite hope – finite hope that involves concrete possibilities and infinite hope that sets our sights to purposes and visions toward a transcendent God, beyond specific concrete possibilities.<sup>34</sup> Dunlap discusses five qualities of hope that are useful for thinking about the way that music making might inspire hope.<sup>35</sup> First, hope is an action, not only a feeling. The actual act of doing something such as singing or picking up an instrument, even when one doesn’t feel like it, can be an action toward a hope-filled future. Second, hope is specific and detailed. The actual concentration on the specifics of a piece, the practicing toward getting a phrase right, or of adding ornamentation, can leave a person feeling more hopeful – even if one learns only a bar of music. Third, hope is wildly patient. The idea that an amateur musician could actually learn a new piece of music, with all the challenges involved, requires a determined perseverance that communicates hope. Fourth, hope is impatient as it seeks to resist oppression. Music that articulates resisting narratives, whether in lyrics or in music, projects hope that life can be different. Finally, hope is communal. The community setting of playing music can overcome social isolation and loneliness, offering hope for human connection.

To these qualities, I want to add a few observations about the relationship of music and hope. Music supports and encourages hope, first, when the music attunes and resonates with us, producing a deep form of empathy; second, when it expresses emotions that we cannot or do not want to express in words; third, when it helps us live with ambiguity and opens us to mystery.

Some music we hear or play with our head, we like it, the experience is pleasurable but not memorable. Other music vibrates deep into our internal organs, throughout our bodies, into the marrow of our bones. The experience is visceral, though it also engages our cognition. The satisfaction of the visceral experience of music is an empathic experience similar to the experience of intimate conversation with a friend who knows and understands as fully as another human being can. In both kinds of empathy, mind and body are united and our soul is stirred. The experience of such deep empathy through and with art is described by Gilbert Rose using the words “attunement” and “emotional resonance.” Each has to do with the patterns of tension and release in aesthetic form and the patterns that “arouse each persons’ *resonating* personal association and individual emotions.”<sup>36</sup> Although many emotions may be aroused by such resonance, the satisfaction of resonance itself provides the nourishment for hope.

Music also can express different parts of our experience than language expresses. Though we at times interpret musical pieces with language, the language always falls short because music and verbal language are incommensurable. Susanne Langer, in *Philosophy in a New Key*, argued

that music is an alternative symbol system that creates a structure, a form, around feeling.<sup>37</sup> In so doing, our unstructured, amorphous, or chaotic feelings are gathered up into symbolic expression. When that happens, the symbol helps to contain our feelings. We begin to experience a sense of control, as if we are not at the mercy of floating feelings but able to experience them in a more concrete way that leads to expression. As this happens, we express parts of ourselves that cannot be expressed any other way, either by making music ourselves or by listening to music that expresses us. Langer's philosophical claim has been empirically substantiated by Howard Gardner's work on musical intelligence – Gardner has demonstrated that music is a symbol system that is created in a very different part of the brain than linguistic intelligence.<sup>38</sup> Both Langer's philosophical and Gardner's neurological studies suggest that musical resonance can be very personal: it is probably determined by biology, culture, intelligence, and individual development, among other factors. In hymn singing, therefore, when lyrics are set to tunes, more than one tune may be experienced as appropriate enough to the lyrical expression to offer alternative settings. The idea *that* music expresses a part of our humanity that we find satisfaction in expressing, that it symbolizes and gives form of feelings, and that it may help us make our way through a maze of emotional associations is enough to suggest that music can contribute to transformation toward hope.

Music resonates and expresses us, but we do not always “know” what it expresses. For most people, “to know” something is to put it into words. Once something is known, it becomes concrete. Paradoxically, music with which we resonate deeply allows us to experience and express that which we cannot know. We may not “know” what we express; rather, we express a deeply visceral experience for which words are inadequate. We find ourselves and find self-expression – as Clarence Deveau put it, “You hear it and it brings you into their world or into part of your world that you don't visit everyday. And it's a very pleasant experience, whether it makes you sad or happy.” It may bring us to the edge of finite experience, into the experience of limit where we may meet the divine. Since people vary so significantly in the personal experience of music, this experience of the divine in music is also varied and personal. If in pastoral care we seek to join our narrative to a divine narrative, and we may find an expression of divine mystery in a deep, unknowable, and unarticulable way in music, then we should be cautious about defining music as either sacred and or secular. Depending upon a whole series of factors, a person may find patriotism or divine mystery in a drinking song.

### Emotional Renewal, Hope and the New Creation

An interesting moment of pastoral care is quoted in Hildebrand's introductory essay, ““A Little Body of Experimental and Practical Divinity,”” in *Works: 7*. Charles Wesley writes,

‘At night my brother came, exceeding heavy. I forced him (as he had often forced me) to sing an hymn to Christ, and almost thought he (Christ) would come while we were singing; assured he would come quickly.’<sup>39</sup>

Why would the Wesleys sing a hymn, rather than praying or reading Scripture, at a time when they sought Christ's presence? The “heaviness” of which Charles speaks might be relieved

by reassurance of the presence of Christ, might be transformed with prayer or Scripture, but was aided by music. As we read in John Wesley's essay, 'Thoughts on the Power of Music,'<sup>40</sup> he was familiar with aesthetic philosophy and the power described in the philosophy of music to arouse a wide range of emotions in the hearer – sometimes by intention of the musician. He argues that music that is dependent on harmony and counterpoint does not arouse the emotions in the way that a simple melody line does. For Wesley, the simple melody line resonates – the reason he gives is that melody, rather than harmony, is constructed according to the principles of nature, rather than art. He concludes that the melody of Scotch and Irish airs makes them powerful – that such melodious music is not only heard but *felt* (emphasis his). One of the Irish airs that Wesley must have decided had the potential to bring people to the experience of divinity was Turlogh O'Carolan's 'Roisin Dubh', an air that was adapted to become the Wesleys' tune Athlone. 'Roisin Dubh' has survived four hundred years of folk music transmission and is frequently played in Irish sessions and taught to students of Irish fiddling today!

Wesley's belief that music, especially melody lines, could arouse the full range of emotions helps to make sense of his instructions for singing – instructions that seemed to be aimed at engaging emotions without letting them become destructive.<sup>41</sup> Controlled emotional arousal was necessary to a heart-felt religion – a religion that engaged the mind, heart, and soul. In some ways, his guidance for singing was an attempt to structure the emotional arousal that music could create.

If music itself arouses and structures feeling into emotional expression through symbol, then singing lyrics to that music adds an additional symbol system that may help to increase the emotional associations between the musical and lyrical expression. Given their beliefs about the power of music to arouse emotions, it would make sense that the Wesleys would want to make good use of this power on behalf of religious experience and to structure this experience so that desired religious ends were sought. However, they would also want to build some control into the musical experience. The lyrics of the hymnody help to structure musical emotion, creating associations between the melodies and the emotions to be transformed.

This structuring of emotion is evident in the pattern of transformation that is evident in many of the hymns of the new creation. The section "For Believers, Groaning for Full Redemption," (Hymns 331-379), a section that addresses the ripening of already relatively mature faith, the theme of transformation and the new creation is prominent. Hope is only occasionally mentioned, in contrast to love, which is the *telos* of most of the hymns. Yet the flow of the hymns, themselves, are intended to produce hope for transformation in the believer. This hope is both for a transformation of that which is awry in the soul and for the deepening and spreading of that which is right in the soul: the already established image of God.

The hymns express a range of conditions of the soul that need to be transformed: unbelief (Hymn 332); sin, guilt, disgrace (Hymn 337, 341); roving passions and a wandering soul (Hymn 335); vile affections, including lust, low-thoughted care, pride, wrath, anger, hate, jealousy (Hymns 35, 338, 341); rebelliousness and self-will (Hymn 335, 338); barren souls (Hymn 339); physical infirmity (Hymn 339); sorrow, tears, gloominess, grief, death (Hymn 339); heart (Hymn 341, 342); doubt, fear, helplessness (Hymn 355, 356, 359). What pleas are made build upon the image of God already taking root in the person? Such pleas emerge as "Stretch my faith's capacity" (361); "Knit my thankful heart to thee" (362); "The temple of my soul prepare/ And

fix thy sacred presence there (363); and others. Toward what hope should this transformation occur? The hoped-for transformation is a transformation toward love (Hymns 353, 355), though much more is mentioned: faithfulness (Hymn 333); renewal of heart (Hymn 334); cleansing (Hymn 338); hope (Hymn 337); the fruits of grace: joy, peace, righteousness, holy tempers gladness (Hymn 339); partnership with God (Hymn 339); oneness with God (Hymn 341); God and Jesus taking root in the person (Hymns 342, 345); and peace (Hymns 353, 355). Most significantly almost all hymns in this section, and in the sections “Believers Interceding for the World” and “For the Society” end in a vision of the hoped-for transformation: they never leave the singer in the state of convicted of sin and despair. An upbeat ending such as the plea that ends the famous “Loves Divine, All Loves Excelling” is the norm: “Finish then thy new creation. Pure and spotless let us be; Let us see thy great salvation/ Perfectly restored in thee; Changed from glory into glory, till in heaven we take our place,/ Till we cast our crowns before thee, Lost in wonder, love, and praise.”<sup>42</sup> The hymnody develops a progression: from that which needs to be transformed, to the image of God in the person that can be strengthened, with a vision of transformation toward love, and hope that the transformation will be forthcoming. The concern for a movement toward hope is a concern widely shared by pastoral care literature.

#### The New Creation, Hymnody, and Pastoral Care

Recent pastoral care literature has identified markers -- an image of the future, finite and infinite hope, action, concretion, patience and impatience, and community -- of transformation toward hope. How do those markers illumine the way that this hymnody serves the purpose of transforming toward hope?

Most Wesleyan hymnody concludes by declaring a future hope. The new creation and transformation toward hope are interdependent in a particularly interesting way in the section on “Groaning for the Spirit.” This section of the hymnal is actually a stunning piece of pastoral theology because of the human anthropology upon which the section is dependent. It communicates that the relatively mature Christian can understand himself or herself as one who does have goodness upon which to draw – goodness that is rooted in God – but also still needs transformation of that which is awry. One of the most difficult psychological problems is attaining this kind of integration – one that is realistic enough to appreciate both the goodness in who one is and at the same time as recognizing that all is not well. An reimagined future that can draw on goodness and be realistic about sin is a hopeful one, indeed.

These hymns communicate the relationship between the finite and infinite hope with which pastoral theology has been concerned. What is hoped for frequently is the human’s ability to love in this life, a finite hope, that finds its resolution in the love of God, an infinite hope. The love that is the *telos* of many of the hymns is a love that is to be manifested now, on earth; but it is a love that also finds its final home in eternity. Compare, for example, the infinite love manifested in this life at the conclusion of Hymn 354: “Thus may I show thy Spirit within, Which purges me from every stain;/ Unspotted from the world and sin/ My faith’s integrity maintain, The truth of my religion prove/ By perfect purity and love.” And example of the transition from an earthly infinite hope to a heavenly infinite hope occurs in Hymn 362: “In suffering be thy love my peace,/ In weakness be thy love my power;/ And when the storms of life shall cease,/ Jesu, in that important hour,/ In death as life be thou my guide,/ And save me,

who for me hast died.”

These hymns provide a very nuanced understanding of hopeful action. First, they are sung: singing itself is action. In addition, the lyrics frequently communicate the action of God in implanting Godself in human hearts, and the action of the human being who cooperated with God. They communicate patience and impatience: patience in the lyrics of hymns that directly deal with being patient before God, but impatience in the constant pleas for the recreation of the human in the likeness of God.

In two markers, they fall somewhat short of a full-bodied hopefulness: they are somewhat lacking in concreteness and in communal experience. On concreteness: They are concrete to the extent that the metaphors and symbols of the lyrics provide a container into which to place the concrete experiences of ordinary life (for example, the metaphor “sorrows” becomes the place where concrete deaths, losses, and disappointments must be placed by the singer.) Some people may need a fuller breadth of concrete circumstances addressed in private devotions; but, in public devotions, the use of such metaphors and symbols as containers help to allow for the gathering of all that needs to be placed before God without exhibitionism. On communal experience: The section on “Groaning for the Spirit” is about individual Christian experience; the sections of the hymnal on “Intercessions for the World” and “For the Society” address a broader experience. But, are these intercessions broad enough? The “Intercessions for the World” intercede on behalf of peace where there is war, faith where there are beliefs other than Christianity, believers that have fallen away, family and servants, and individuals coming to faith. The section “For the Society” expresses concern for the building up of faith and the presence of God in the community: communal versions of groaning. On one hand, the hymnody does bear a marker of hope. In the community persons often need to hope for one another, when one cannot hope for oneself. But is the community wide enough? As we will explore in the next section of this paper, the absence of direct reference in this section of the hymnal to many of the “community” to whom the Wesleys went in mission, such as the destitute, the mentally disturbed, and the prisoners, is puzzling.

This kind of hope is part of the action of basic participatory care. The possibility of hope is shared in the interconnections of our lives. In communities we share and strengthen our hope with one another.

#### **IV. Building Communities Across Boundaries**

The importance of community building for care is a theme that has emerged with intensity in recent years. The work of Robert Bellah, et.al., in *Habits of the Heart* first popularized the idea that people in the United States are expressive individualists, for whom community is a fading value.<sup>43</sup> Robert Putnam’s *Bowling Alone* further popularized the theme of the decline of voluntary associations, including religious congregations.<sup>44</sup> William Julius Wilson’s *The Truly Disadvantaged* established the idea that the decline of institutions in the inner city characterized the decline of inner city communities themselves, leaving a void filled by crime, drugs, family instability, and other social dysfunctions.<sup>45</sup> Family studies conducted by the Annie E. Casey foundation indicate that families are most stable in places where community institutions are strong and communities and neighborhoods are stable. More work connecting community

development to pastoral care is needed.

Along with the newly recognized significance of communities and institutions has been a new emphasis in pastoral care on care within the congregation. Among others, Margaret Kornfeld's *Cultivating Wholeness: A Guide to Care and Counseling in Faith Communities* has emphasized the importance of congregational networking so that the whole of the congregation can be responsive to pastoral care concerns.<sup>46</sup> Such books go a long way toward illuminating the spiritual and faith resources of congregations in the service of the needs of the congregation. They begin to address, in part, one of the vexing problems of congregational life today: building stable communities that cross boundaries of age, race, ethnicity, class, and sexual orientation.

### Building Communities Across Boundaries through Music

Part of what has most fascinated me in participatory music groups is the gathering of people who make music together. In Rochester at an open mike I attended for a period of time, the diversity was astounding, representing a variety of social locations: for example, the regulars included a professor of political science; a member of the school board; a member of the clergy suffering from emotional disability; a student of ethnomusicology; a homeschooling housewife and her family; a father and his teenage son who sang rock songs together; an eighty year old widower who openly joked about his sexual desire; and several professional local musicians and instrument repair people. It was a motley crew, held together by the music and the spirit of generosity, friendship, and advocacy in the leadership of the musicians in charge. If this "congregation" were a Christian faith community, it would struggle with its diversity. Mitzie Collins has returned as the music director at St. Ambrose Church. St. Ambrose is a small congregation in a neighborhood that intentionally sought to become racially and socioeconomically diverse. This effort succeeded for two decades, but as the local economy declined, the institutional network became weak. Homeownership declined, and some community organizations relocated. Collins describes her struggle to use music to build community and sustain diversity through participatory music at St. Ambrose. The congregation is largely white and Jamaican-American; the pastor is a white sixty-year old who prefers praise choruses and African-American gospel music. Mitzie had hoped that the musical style that she could bring to the church – from classical to folk – would help to revitalize the church. But, now she has a more limited goals. can interspersing some of the traditional hymnody with gospel and praise choruses engage the emotions of the Jamaicans *and* provide a home for the Caucasian population? She says:

Mitzie: . . . right now it's kind of halcyon, because, white families who have run it for a long time are still there. Over the years it's had some very strong leadership from . . . Jamaican-Americans. But for various reasons they get better jobs, they retire, they do things, so some of that leadership is not there. So, at the moment, it would be a shared leadership. But I would say in the next few years . . . (the present pastor will retire) . . . If they got a black clergyman there . . . which would be a perfect congregation to get one, I think the congregation would turn into largely Jamaican. Maybe not totally, but largely.

Pam: Do you try to mix the music styles?

Mitzie: I do, I do! And I also try to include, uh, historically other things, like 16<sup>th</sup> century, Orlando Di Lasso, which I also think is valid. And, actually, the clergyman who's there, he doesn't really think so, he thinks . . . we should just do all modern praise or African American music, but I'm thinking, we aren't all African Americans. First of all, the . . . Church is a whole thing. . . and we have all these great hymns, and uh, I don't want to throw all that away.

In my own congregation in Rochester diversity of musical style has been crucial for attracting people of color to a historically white congregation. Over a period of years, and with the help of the new United Methodist Hymnal and Sampler, we have become accustomed to multicultural and praise hymnody and anthems, though choir room conversation reveals that the preference of choir members is as diverse as the music. Perhaps it is as difficult to continue historical hymnody in a church in transition as it is to introduce multicultural hymnody into a dominantly Caucasian congregation:

Pam: See this goes back to the narrative question. What you're trying to do is to say that the church has a long deep narrative

Mitzie: Yes! Can I quote you to the church? It has a long deep narrative and I personally in the music am trying to reflect that narrative. . . .Every now and then I'll hit the nail on the head and somebody will come up to me and say, I sang that sitting at my grandmother's house in Jamaica. I love that hymn. It will be some grand English Victorian hymn. I can just see them, dressed in white, sweating, dressed to the teeth, in Jamaica, by golly, they went to church with their grandmother.

The issue of diversity and participation in music stretches not only to race and ethnicity but to age:

Mitzie: One (Jamaican) woman . . . said, "It never occurred to me to tell my grandmother I wouldn't go to church with her." . . . She brings her kids to church quite faithfully. They're very non-participatory. And I also try to get music that will some how get people to participate in the music at some level, and that's just very, very hard.

In Mitzie's story we willing to lend her efforts toward community building because of her own narrative and emotional transformation:

Mitzie: So I haven't transformed St. Ambrose, but one of the reasons why I wanted to go back there (was that) being at St. Ambrose thirty years ago was transforming to me.

Such transformation is mutual and reciprocal, a new creation of gratitude and grace that nourishes

new recreation.

## Wesleyan Music and the Societies

Building community within and providing pastoral care to a diverse population emerged from the marrow of the Wesleyan movement. According to Andrew Wilson-Dickson, the hymn singing seems to have been a practice that grew along with mission among the poor. Hymn singing emerged as part of a larger musical revival, beginning with Benjamin Keats and Isaac Watts. Prior to the Wesleyan revival, charity schools founded by the Society for the Promotion of Christian Knowledge already had choirs of schoolchildren whose singing, along with organ playing, transformed worship.<sup>47</sup> The Wesleys, he claims, were willing to adapt new, lower church musical traditions that furthered their mission to reach the poor, rather than the Anglican elite.

John Wesley concludes the “Plain Account of the People Called Methodists” with his thoughts about the ministry with several groups of people about whom he was particularly concerned: the sick, the poor that were sick, widows and others who had none to care for them, children, and those in need of credit.<sup>48</sup> In these sections he outlines the practical program he had developed for the care of each group. Though he cared for those in need without regard for their membership in Methodist societies, he described the organization that emerged to maintain caring connections between individuals in each of these groups and the societies. This care was built into the basic identity of the Wesleyan movement, as described in the “Plain Account of the People Called Methodists” and the “The Nature, Design, and General Rules of the United Societies.”<sup>49</sup> For Wesley, the growth of Christian character naturally developed into “relieving” the people.

The full connection between the grace of God, the growth of Christian character, and neighbor love for strangers is found in Hymn 354. In the first verse, the believer knows the goodness of God and seeks God in the heart. In the second, the believer asks for the fruits of the spirit: nourishment, peace, and joy. In the third, the believer asks for an additional bestowal of the grace of God. In the fourth, the mind of Christ is shown through the believer as the believer becomes a vehicle for God’s love:

Thy mind throughout my life be shown,  
*While listening to the wretch’s cry,*  
*The widow’s and the orphan’s groan,*  
*On mercy’s wings I swiftly fly*  
*The poor and helpless to relieve,*  
My life, my all for them to give.

In the last verse, the believer proclaims that the believer shows the love of God in such perfect purity and love.

In this hymn, the progression of the Christian life moves from the prevenient grace of God that the believer finds in the heart, to transformation of the believer’s nature into a God-like nature, to the manifestation of that nature in care for the neighbor. However, the full progression

that one finds in this hymn is relatively rare in the *Collection of Hymns (1780)*. Most of the hymns in this volume orient the singer to love but do not specify who among the human community are particularly in need of loving attention.

In a collection of hymns by Charles Wesley entitled “A Song for the Poor,” edited by S T Kimborough, Jr. and Timothy E. Kimbrough, fifteen hymns that specifically sing the Wesleyan ministry with the poor are reproduced.<sup>50</sup> These hymns particularly stress the Wesleys cared *with* the poor, considering them their friends. Of these hymns, only “Try Us, O God, and Search the Ground” was selected for the *Collection of Hymns (1780)*. The rest can be found in Charles’ unpublished poetry, Charles’ journal, and the earlier hymnal, “Short Hymns of Select Passages of the Holy Scriptures.”<sup>51</sup> The constant practice of the Wesleyan mission, and the relative paucity with which this mission is reflected in the most widely used hymnody that became the *Collection of Hymns (1780)*, represents a disjuncture in the Wesleyan narrative as communicated through its hymnody. It is especially puzzling in light of the date of publication of the hymnal and John Wesley’s late in life disappointment in the direction his movement was heading. I can offer two hunches to make sense of this break in the Wesleyan narrative. Both possibilities are instructive for music and pastoral care.

One possibility is this: in the “Plain Account of the People Called Methodists” John Wesley states that religion is not established by *orthodoxy*, which is “at best but a very slender part of religion, if it can be allowed to be any part of it all,” nor does it consist in “*negatives*” or “*externals*,” whether they are works of piety or works of mercy. True religion can only arise from the new creation in the heart of the believer – from “ ‘the mind that was in Christ’, ‘the image of God’ stamped upon the heart, inward ‘righteousness’, attended with the ‘peace’ of God, and ‘joy in the Holy Ghost.’ ”<sup>52</sup> In other words, any acts of devotion or charity must truly be rooted in the *love* of God and neighbor. Therefore, this love must be fostered in the Christian character for any genuine love to be practiced. This love, as mercy or charity, is always a fruit of the spirit rather than an act of human obligation apart from love. For this reason, the foundational issue is Christian experience which then will naturally give rise to the kind of mission the Wesleys saw as central to the gospel. Christian experience needed to be fostered in order to bring about a mission that was motivated by love. By 1780, possibly, Wesley was concerned enough about the direction of his movement that he thought that the issue of formative Christian experience was the level at which the issue of charity and mission needed to be addressed. Wesley’s instruction for pastoral care and music, then, would be that singing about the experience of God’s love cannot be minimized as foundation for both individual and social holiness, character and social ethics.

But the other possibility is this: John Wesley’s goal in the *Collection of Hymns (1780)*, as he states, was to compile the hymns that Society was singing at a price the members of lesser means’ could afford. John says that he sought to provide a hymnbook of the songs most often sung in societies and families, in a form that was not expensive or cumbersome: “the greater part of the people, being poor, cannot purchase so many (hymn) books.”<sup>53</sup> Wesley may have assumed the poor were singing these hymns. Care might already be occurring, so that John might have considered the exhortation to Christian experience as more important than exhortation to relieve the poor. John may have assumed that the Methodists of means sang from a series of hymnals that would have included a more diverse set of hymns specifically identifying Wesleyan

mission. Hymns that recorded the Christian experience of ministry and mission might have been set aside for hymns of experience. If that is the case, John forwent the opportunity to provide correction to the movement through the widespread use of the *Collection of Hymns (1780)*.

For whatever the reason, the *Collection of Hymns (1780)* communicates hope for the individual believer (as argued in section III of this paper) but falls short of the vision of social holiness that might have upheld, had it drawn on a different range of earlier hymnody. If so, then the evolution of Wesleyan hymnody and the evolution of the 20<sup>th</sup> century pastoral care and counseling movement may bear similarities. The pastoral care and counseling movement grew from the holistic movements of the early 20<sup>th</sup> century, the Emmanuel Movement, the health and hygiene movement, and the settlement house movement. The pastoral care and counseling movement became truncated in the individualistic psychologism of the 1950s and 1960s. In the midst of the psychologism it lost its larger theological aim or purpose. The movement has increasingly worked its way back toward larger groups, holding in place its concern for the well-being of individuals and exploring the interdependence between individuals and larger groups: families and congregations. Hopefully, this work will continue to expand to show the interdependence between smaller units of society and larger groups, including communities and nations.

Placing the evolution of the pastoral care and counseling movement and the evolution of Wesleyan hymnody side by side highlights a tension between the experience and well-being of individuals and the role of that experience in larger social and communal purposes. Basic, participatory care, such as one finds in the open mikes, St. Ambrose or Wesleyan Societies, contributes to the value structure in which individuals are shaped and the quality of their experience with one another. The care that is created in the interstices of these relationships improves the quality of life in a community. The way that the community is knit together, who is included and for what purposes, has much to do with the value structure that is promoted in the community itself. That value structure is, and should be, articulated. There is an irony, however, in the relationship between individual experience and larger communal purposes and aims that is highlighted by the instability and tension that is found in both of these movements. If the aim and purpose of group music-making primarily serves larger social and communal purposes, then the group may lose the human qualities that make it a caring community. If, for example, St. Ambrose choir set a goal of drawing and keeping population in St. Ambrose and in Rochester, then people, values and quality of experience might be lost (even though the presence of groups like it could have that effect.) The end could take over the means. Persons, qualities of life, values, and care are lost. The larger church struggles with this tension: social holiness and transformation of society *and* individual Christian experience are interdependent, a means and end that depend upon each other.

## V. Supporting Countercultural, Non-Market Values

In 20<sup>th</sup> century culture medicine and psychoanalysis provided a worldview that legitimated knowledge. In part, these disciplines legitimated knowledge by organizing medical and psychological professions. Professions created ethical standards and practices, a positive result for persons who used their services. Professions also consolidated economic power by exerting power to eliminate the organization of practices that were more closely related to the traditional transmission of knowledge, a negative result that narrowed North America's understanding of healing. The effort of the medical profession to eliminate midwifery in the early 20<sup>th</sup> century is an example of this phenomenon. Although the medical and psychologically- based professions still fight for their turf, they are no longer the primarily legitimators of knowledge. Today, the economic and cultural role of brands is in some ways replacing the professions as the legitimizing economic and cultural force. In this climate participatory music creates resistance, if not outright revolt, against a branded culture.

A branded culture is one organized by economic values, much as the 20<sup>th</sup> century was organized by psychological values. As the economy has taken the place of medicine and psychology as a legitimizing force, values that undergird market performance such as profitability, self-interest, and efficiency are being applied across the board to all of our relationships and activities. Even relationships such as family life and parenting have been described and evaluated with economic models. It is as if the market has woven its web over all human activity and trapped its human prey inside.

During most of the 20<sup>th</sup> century the practitioners of pastoral care walked a tightrope that was strung between religious and scientific values. The pastoral care movement was motivated, in part, by Anton Boisen's insistence that what was being simplified into psychological phenomena actually held complex religious experience. The Emmanuel Movement also worked for several decades to bring together emerging medical knowledge and spiritual healing. In order to gain access to institutions that otherwise would have shut them out, pastoral care practitioners did shape their practices, in part, with an eye toward gaining legitimacy on the basis of values accepted by psychiatrists and medical doctors. In these efforts, the early pastoral care movement created a space to support countercultural values.

Organizations of clinical pastoral care and counseling have discussed their relationship to market forces at length, almost always with a sense of losing ground. Though this sense may be related to the political triumph of licensed helping professions, it may also result from the declining cultural influence of all of the helping professions. As practitioners of pastoral care and counseling fought for their place as a legitimate, alternative helping professionals, they did not anticipate the way that medicine and psychology would themselves become delegitimated by the rise of brands. (The direct marketing of pharmaceuticals to a mass market, by-passing the expert knowledge of doctors and psychiatrists, is an example of this trend.)

Practitioners of care and counseling are beginning to be aware of the implications the development of a branded form of global economics for their work. James Poling has showed the implications of global economics for domestic violence in Nicaragua.<sup>54</sup> The development of the global economy will be the subject of the program of the Intercultural Pastoral Care and

Counselling Association in Bangalore, India in 2003.

An enormous literature describes the way that the global economy has restructured the music industry. Though the music industry has not created brands as such, the marketing of music is an increasingly big issue in its development. In part, music has been shaped by brands as musicians, like athletes, are paid to endorse brand names.

In both fields, there seems to be little room in which to sustain the exercise of values that resist the motives of the market. For those people who think that human flourishing requires some free space for activity and imagination that is not focused toward the aims of the market, participatory music may be an increasingly important activity of care.

Music Away From the Market

One of the characteristics of Cape Breton, Nova Scotia, is the absence of brands. The local tourist industry consists of mom-and-pop motels and restaurants or cooperatives that support local tourist establishments and crafts. In this unbranded space Clarence Deveau commented:

And in most cases I think that being (a) professional (musician) gets in the way of what's real. All of a sudden it's how marketable it is, and is it gonna be profitable, or can we afford to do it like that or should we take the chance, where these are people who have never been involved in the industry, doing things for the right reasons and it comes from the right place and it moves you like I think music is supposed to do.

Rochester, however, is far from unbranded. Its economy is heavily dependent upon the actions of three multinational companies, Kodak, Xerox and Bausch and Lomb, though the reports suggest that small entrepreneurs are emerging and becoming increasingly important to the local economy. Some speculate about Rochester's return as a technology haven, in part, because Rochester has a well-supported arts community. When I asked Mitzie Collins whether she thought that participatory music was creating a space for an activity that is not governed by market values, she thought of New Horizons, the senior citizen's band that is open to all persons over fifty, whether or not they have previous experience with an instrument:

Mitzie: . . . here's New Horizons. . . that's just a crazy thing. . . I mean it's ridiculous to think that you can start people from zero and teach them flute, I mean, I have a lady who plays in my church orchestra . . . . And she started ten years ago, she heard about New Horizons and she said, but I don't play an instrument, and they said, well, what do you want to play? So she picked flute. She learned to play the flute. She plays with them! I mean, this is terrifically meaningful to her. I mean it's a crazy thing to think you can take a bunch of people that were like high school dropouts on their instruments (Pam: laughter: like me) or that never played at all and have them play. And it's wonderful, it's terrific.

Pam: It defies the body, for one thing. I mean, the body is not supposed to do these things after 50 if they've never done them before.

Mitzie: No, and they play together, actually these people have time to rehearse, it's quite amazing, and now the concept has spread around, and, that is not folk, so what's interesting about it is, here's a whole process that could be folk but it's not.

Pam: It's a participatory music process that is applied to classical music.

Mitzie: Exactly. . . .It's not supposed to work!

New Horizons, a band and orchestra that is open to anyone over the age of fifty, is not efficient or profitable. The first time I observed the New Horizons band, the band leader, with a big smile on his face and exuding good will, singled out the bass drummer, who didn't have the beat of one measure quite right. The band leader worked with the bass drummer alone for a good five or more minutes, clapping out the rhythm of the measure, that the drummer just couldn't get right. But the band leader showed no impatience; he just smiled and exuded confidence that the drummer would get the beat, while sixty other band members waited and watched. The leader would not be deterred: the music would not be played with wrong beat, nor would he give up on the bass drummer's participation. Eventually, the drummer got it, and the band played on. In the mutual persistence of the band leader and the drummer, we catch a glimpse of countercultural values: patience, persistence, care for the one with a special need:

292

Give me on thee to wait,  
Till I can all things do,  
On thee almighty to create  
Almighty to renew.

### Wesleyan Practices and Countercultural Values

In previous Oxford Institutes Wesleyan theologians have demonstrated that God as understood through the Wesleyan economic ethic is deeply concerned for those whom society would consider "outcasts."<sup>55</sup> These theologians have demonstrated that what I am calling non-market, countercultural values comprise an essential element in the Wesleyan tradition. The values at stake raise the issue of power: whether those who practice Wesleyan values befriend and support -- lend their religious power to -- those with economic power, or whether those who practice Wesleyan values use their power on behalf of those who are disenfranchised by economic power.<sup>56</sup> Should those who practice Wesleyan values allow their own lives to be shaped exclusively by the market economy, or should they resist that shaping by creating and participating in spaces where non-market values can survive and thrive?

The shaping of participatory values in the Wesleyan tradition of music making occurred, in part, in three spaces not governed by market values: in Charles Wesley's practices in his own life; in the poetic imagery he uses; in his vision of the Society as companion with the dispossessed. The significance of these three non-market spaces is suggested by S T Kimbrough's paper, *A Song for the Poor: Hymns by Charles Wesley*.<sup>57</sup> In this paper Kimbrough quotes from Charles Wesley's unpublished hymnody, journals, and smaller hymnals, to build a

picture of Charles' concern for "outcasts" and how Charles' hymnody includes them in the Wesleyan experience. Kimbrough's work suggests that Charles was personally concerned for and involved with the dispossessed; that he used poetic means in the hymnody that allowed the dispossessed to identify his hymnody; and that he communicated imperatives to the church about the necessity of the church's ministry with the poor. Following this lead, we can surmise ways that Wesleyan hymnody might have created space for values that undermined the values of the reigning economic powers of the day.

Charles' life practices are significantly more concerned for social holiness than commonly thought, according to Kimbrough. Samuel Wesley's early influence on John and Charles led them to practice care for those who were sick, institutionalized, and uneducated in their early religious lives, prior to their conversions. Far from making the poor into objects of charity, Charles considered the poor "his friends." Charles and the poor are friends, I will add, in the intimate and mutual sense of the christological title Friend. Charles is a friend to the poor, and the poor are friends to Charles, attending him even when he was sick. He was also Friend and Advocate: Charles at least on one occasion arbitrated with a civil magistrate on behalf of the poor. His life practices are found in the development of Wesleyan hymnody.

Wesleyan hymnody contains "metaphors, similes, figures of speech, and nomenclature with which the dispossessed of English society could identify,"<sup>58</sup> Kimbrough says. In my analysis this language appears most frequently in the earlier sections of the 1780 hymnal that call the believer into an initial relationship with God. Such imagery appears in the metaphors in some of the more famous hymns, such as Hymn 1, "he breaks the power of cancelled sin, He sets the prisoner free;" Hymn 2, "ye poor, and maimed, and halt, and blind" and lesser known hymns, Hymn 11: "Poor debtors, by our Lord's request/ A full acquittance we receive!" Hymn 21, "Madness and misery/ Ye count our life beneath"; Hymn 28: "Jesus calls his wanderers home"; Hymn 29: "Outcasts of men, to you I call,/ Harlots and publicans, and thieves!"; Hymn 34: "Gather the outcasts in, and save/ From sin and Satan's power."; Hymn 35: "Lovers of pleasure. . . Swearers. . . Misers. . . Drunkards. . .," and so on. If the dispossessed were able to identify with these images, then the singing of hymns themselves might create a hospitable, friendly space for the dispossessed to connect with the Methodist Society.

The Wesleys, however, thought the poor and rich alike needed the experience of God. The music supported bringing the dispossessed into the movement but also sought to transform of the practices of the privileged. The hymnody occasionally makes specific addresses to the privileged, as in Hymn 7: "You, on whom he favours showers,/ You, possessed of nobles power,/ You, of reason's powers possessed,/ You, with will and memory blest:/ You, with finer sense endued,/ Noblest of his creatures, why,/ Why will you for ever die?" Any of these addresses might be understood literally or figuratively and in an egalitarian manner: regardless of with which metaphors and forms of address people might identify, the most frequent and egalitarian title is "sinner". Once that connection is made, the poor and the privileged are addressed as sinners and believers and are expected to engage in the same pattern of Christian development. The issue of making space for alternative practices, however, depends not only on the people, poor and rich, who can recognize themselves in the hymns, but on the narratives, practices, and values that bring transformation to their lives.

Finally, the hymnody teaches the church to practice an egalitarian, inclusive care,

Kimbrough suggests. Because God loves the poor, and because the poor take the place of Christ in the world, the poor in the church help it critically evaluate its attitude toward wealth, make welcome all persons who come to the sacraments, and serve the poor, as the kind of discipleship mandated for clergy and laity. By joining believers in the practice of singing together, these egalitarian, inclusive values were being embodied. In that sense, all of the practices of the church come under scrutiny for the space they create or constrict for values that contribute to human flourishing. The Wesleyan movement holds before all a vision of a new creation in which Christ-like care, friendship, advocacy, and comfort are the norm, not the exception.

What does the hymnody have to teach about power, especially as it is exercised in various forms of care? The hymnody may perform several functions in relation to the crucial exercise of power in care. The way that Charles used power as a musical leader to engage others in music making provides an example of the way that one with special talent, training, and credentials can use his power to engage the participation of others who may not have his musical privileges. This power, however, was not used in such a way as to replicate Charles and to consolidate his power. Although some became musical leaders (such as John Lampe, arranger of a number of Wesleyan tunes), it primarily sought to empower a particular vision of life in those who participated – a vision of how to live Christian values in the individual experience of God, in personal relationships and in community. As participants embodied those qualities in their music making, care, hope, relationships, and power were created in the web of the community's life. Wesleyan music making supported non-market values, for example, in the music practices of the orphanages and charity schools that the movement supported.

Contemporary musical practices, like practices of pastoral care and counseling, may be somewhat marginalized practices that need to support efforts to consolidate power as a way to make room for those practices to re-occur. This power, then, must be infused into the community. The arts and helping services have in common the problem of establishing and maintaining an economic base upon which to build quality services. In Rochester the tradition of support for professional and amateur musicians, largely because of the artistic and musical interests of George Eastman, founder of Eastman Kodak Company and the Eastman School of Music, may have set in place a climate that allows participatory music to flourish, a tradition that is carried on by community musicians such as Mitzie Collins. In Cheticamp the leadership of professionals such as Clarence Deveau, and others related to the radio station, may create a climate within which traditional participatory music can reemerge. Collins and Deveau, each in their own way, may be examples of musical leaders who empower communities, much as Charles Wesley did, so that community musicians have opportunities that would not have previously existed. Their vision is not communicated through the lyrics of music as Charles Wesley's was, raising the question again of whether the lyrics or the simply the practice of participatory music-making itself supports the values inherent in participatory care. In each case, however, care – and power – are infused into the community by participatory music. In either case, what we find is a new creation – a transformative use of power that creates space for care and resists the total encroachment of market values.

## VI. Conclusions

“Participatory pastoral care” is an essential kind of care that is presupposed by more specialized forms of care. It is interpersonal and communal, and is created in the activities of a community, such as participatory music making. It is care that communicates and practices values that are often not promoted by legitimized world views – values such as generosity, inclusivity, acceptance, forgiveness, compassion. These values are practiced and perpetuated by many participatory music making communities where professionals and amateurs make music together, and such care thickens in these communities. The historical example of the participatory music making of Wesleyan hymnody helps to illumine five aspects of this care.

1. Participatory pastoral care is care “we all do” – care in which the Christian participates as part of the Christian life style and experience. In so doing, we model our lives after the example and practice of Jesus Christ. Following the model of Jesus Christ, we participate in the new creation -- the transformation of the distorted or alienated parts of our lives into the image of God. We can glimpse a life that cares for the new creation through the many christological titles used in Wesleyan hymnody, titles that give us a finite and partial view of life patterned after Jesus.

2. We make meaning and participate in transformation as we practice participatory values in our own lives and as we find transcendence by participating in larger cultural narratives. For many people, the larger cultural narrative in which they find themselves is Christian. As we join our own individual narratives to the communal Christian narrative we construct our expectations of what Christian experience will be. Music making is for many people a significant way of joining their individual narrative to a larger communal narrative. The *Collection of Hymns (1780)*, organized around a progression of the spiritual life rather than around the life of Christ in the liturgical year, offers a particularly experiential approach to helping Christians construct their individual and communal religious experience.

3. We care for ourselves and for one another by transforming emotions such as despair and suffering into hope. Music-making has the power to sustain hope both through music and through lyrics. Lyrics of the Wesleyan hymnody sought to structure the transformation of emotion from recognition of that which is awry toward the rootedness of Christ in the soul and the growth of the image of God in the person.

4. In a world in which people are becoming more socially isolated, it is increasingly important to build communities across boundaries of difference. The Wesleyan movement sought incorporate different groups of people into a common religious community. In so doing, it attended to the unstable interdependence between individual and social holiness. In this regard, neither the pastoral care and counseling movement nor the *Collection of Hymns (1780)* was fully successful.

5. In a world in which market values threatens to shape all of life’s experiences, it is important to create spaces where countercultural, non-market values can be practiced. Participatory music that is shared by professionals and amateurs can create such space, as did the musical leadership of the Wesleys.

In a world that is increasingly governed by instrumental values, we are in deep need of

places where we find human beings doing things together, not for profit, efficiency, or self-interest, but “for the love of it.” These are places of grace, hosted by the Greatest Amateur, the God of the new creation.

<sup>1</sup> See Roy Herndon Steinhoff Smith, *The Mutuality of Care* (Chalice, 1999)

<sup>2</sup> See Margaret Zipse Kornfeld, *Cultivating Wholeness: A Guide to Care and Counseling in Faith Communities* (Continuum Publishing Company, 1998) See also *Circuit Rider: How Can the Congregation Act as a Caring Community?* (4:25 July-August, 2001).

<sup>3</sup> See Emmanuel Lartey, *In Living Colour: An Intercultural Approach to Pastoral Care and Counseling* (London: Cassell, 1997)

<sup>4</sup> See Don S Browning, *Practical Theology: The Emerging Field in Theology, Church, and World* (Harper and Row, 1983); Edward Farley, *Theologia: The Fragmentation and Unity of Theological Education* (Philadelphia: Fortress Press, 1983); James N Poling and Donald E. Miller, *Foundations for a Practical Theology of Ministry* (Nashville: Abingdon, 1985); Lewis S. Mudge and James N. Poling, *Formation and Reflection: The Promise of Practical Theology* (Philadelphia: Fortress Press, 1987); Don S. Browning, *A Fundamental Practical Theology: Descriptive and Strategic Proposals* (Minneapolis: Fortress Press, 1991); Johannes van der Ven, *Practical Theology: An Empirical Approach* (Kok Pharos Publishing House: Kampen, the Netherlands, 1993); Don Saliers, *Worship as Theology: Foretaste of Glory Divine* (Nashville: Abingdon Press, 1994); Paul Ballard and John Pritchard: *Practical Theology in Action: Christian Thinking in the Service of Church and Society* (London: SPCK, 1996); Elaine L. Graham, *Transforming Practice: Pastoral Theology in an Age of Uncertainty* (London: Mowbray, 1996); Dorothy Bass, ed. *Practicing our Faith: A Way of Life for a Searching People* (San Francisco: Jossey Bass, 1997); Gerben Heitink, *Practical Theology: History, Theory, Action Domains* (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1999); Marcel Viau, *Practical Theology: A New Approach* (Leiden: Brill, 1999); Paul Ballard and Pam Couture, *Globalisation and Difference: Practical Theology in a World Context* (Cardiff: Cardiff Academic Press, 1999); Duncan Forrester, *Truthful Action: Explorations in Practical Theology* (Edinburgh: T and T Clark, 2000); Paul Ballard and Pam Couture, *Creativity, Imagination and Criticism: The Expressive Dimension in Practical Theology* (Cardiff: Cardiff Academic Press, 2001); Miroslav Volf and Dorothy Bass, ed., *Practicing Theology: Beliefs and Practices in the Christian Life* (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2002); Pamela Couture and Bonnie J. Miller McLemore, eds. *Poverty, Suffering and HIV-AIDS* (Cardiff: Cardiff Academic Press, 2003).

<sup>5</sup> Larry Kent Graham, *Discovering Images of God: Narratives of Care Among Lesbians and Gays* (Louisville: Westminster John Knox Press, 1997) and Leroy T Howe, *The Image of God: A Theology of Pastoral Care and Counseling* (Nashville, Abingdon Press, 1995)

<sup>7</sup> Larry Kent Graham, *Care of Persons, Care of Worlds: A Psychosystems Approach to Pastoral Care and Counseling* (Nashville: Abingdon, 1992), 20 See also, Roy Herndon SteinhoffSmith, *The Mutuality of Care* (St. Louis: Chalice Press, 1989).

<sup>8</sup> Jean Stairs, *Listening for the Soul: Pastoral Care and Spiritual Direction* (Minneapolis: Fortress Press, 2000)

<sup>9</sup> John P Kretzmann and John McKnight, *Building Communities from the Inside Out: A Path toward Finding and Mobilizing a Community's Assets* (Chicago: ACTA Publications, 1993).

<sup>10</sup> SteinhoffSmith, 1

<sup>11</sup> Nancy Cott, *The Grounding of Modern Feminism* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1987)

<sup>12</sup> Rodney Hunter, general ed, *The Dictionary of Pastoral Care and Counseling* (Nashville: Abingdon Press, 1990), 832.

<sup>13</sup> Riet Bons-Storm, *The Incredible Woman: Listening to Women's Silences in Pastoral Care and Counseling* (Nashville: Abingdon Press, 1996)

<sup>14</sup> Hymn numbers are used as found in *The Works of John Wesley: A Collection of Hymns for the use of the People called Methodists*, Franz Hildebrandt and Oliver A Beckerlegge, ed., Vol.7 (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1983).

<sup>15</sup> *The United Methodist Hymnal* (The United Methodist Publishing House, 1989), Hymn 712

<sup>16</sup> Mary Rose O'Reilly, *The Barn at the End of the World: The Apprenticeship of a Quaker, Buddhist Shepherd* (Milkweed Editions, 2000)

<sup>17</sup> Unfortunately, the most public use of the identification of Lamb with Christians, rather than pastors, the title "Lambs of Christ," an anti-abortion group known for harrassing tactics

<sup>18</sup> Another problem with this argument is that substitutionary atonement has been severely criticized by feminist theologians as harmful Personally, I do not find substitutionary models of atonement helpful, but a discussion of models of atonement is beyond the scope of this paper.

<sup>19</sup> Each title is referred to about fifteen times in the *Collection of Hymns (1780)*

20 See Charles V Gerkin, *An Introduction to Pastoral Care* (Nashville: Abingdon Press, 1997), or any of Gerkin's previous books.

21 My thanks to Clarence Deveau, who provided this interview on October 16, 2001

23 Andrew D Lester, *Hope in Pastoral Care and Counseling* (Louisville: Westminster/John Knox Press, 1995), 15-21.

24 Lester, 74

25 Wendy Drewery and John Winslade, "The Theoretical Story of Narrative Therapy," in Gerald Monk, John Winslade, Kathie Crocket, David Epston, eds, *Narrative Therapy in Practice: The Archeology of Hope* (San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, 1997).

26 *Works*: 7, xi

27 *Works*: 7, 2

28 Elaine Ramshaw, *Ritual and Pastoral Care*, in *Theology and Pastoral Care* series, Don Browning, ed, (Philadelphia: Fortress Press, 1987), 27.

29 Gilbert Rose, *Necessary Illusion: Art as Witness* (Madison: International Universities Press, 1996), x

30 James Dittes' *Driven by Hope: Men and Meaning* (Westminster, 1996); Don Capps' *Agents of Hope: A Pastoral Psychology* (Minneapolis: Fortress Press, 1995); Andrew Lester's *Hope in Pastoral Care and Counseling* (Westminster, 1995), Susan Dunlap's *Counseling Depressed Women* (Westminster, 1997); Margaret Kornfeld's *Cultivating Wholeness* (Continuum, 1998)

31 My thanks to Mitzie Collins, who provided this interview on June 27, 2002

32 The name of the church is fictitious

33 Capps, 5-7

34 Lester, 64-69

35 Dunlap, 122-126

36 Rose, 23

37 Susanne Langer, *Philosophy in a New Key* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1942)

38 Howard Gardner, *Frames of Mind: The Theory of Multiple Intelligences* (Basic Books, 1983), 99ff

39 *Works*, 7: 21

40 *Works*, 7:766ff

42 An unusual exception is 442 that concludes: “Less grievous will the judgment day/To Sodom and Gomorrah prove/Than us, who cast our faith away,/And trample on thy richer love” It so deviates from the development of most of the hymns that it seems that concluding verses are missing.

43 Robert Bellah, et al., *Habits of the Heart: Individualism and Commitment in American Life* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1985).

44 Robert Putnam, *Bowling Alone: The Collapse and Revival of American Community* (New York, Simon and Schuster, 2000)

45 William Julius Wilson, *The Truly Disadvantaged: The Inner City, The Underclass, and Public Policy* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1990)

46 Margaret Zipse Kornfeld’s *Cultivating Wholeness: A Guide to Care and Counseling in Faith Communities* (New York: Continuum, 1998), 92

47 Andrew Wilson-Dickson, *The Story of Christian Worship* (Minneapolis: Fortress Press, 1996), 115-117

48 *The Works of John Wesley: The Methodist Societies, History, Nature, and Design, Volume 9* ed. Rupert E. Davies, (Nashville: Abingdon Press, 1989), 274-280.

49 *Works*: 9: 69-74

50 This collection originated as a paper for the Oxford Institute of Methodist Theological Studies, 1992

51 48 Kimbrough, 16-17.

52 *Works*: 9, 254-255

53 *Works*: 7, 73

54 James Poling, *Render Unto God: Economic Vulnerability, Family Violence, and Pastoral Theology* (St Louis: Chalice Press, 2002).

55 55 M. Douglas Meeks *God the Economist: The Doctrine of God and Political Economy* (Fortress Press, 1989), Theodore Jennings, *Good News to the Poor: John Wesley's Evangelical Economics* (Abingdon, 1990) and M. Douglas Meeks, ed., *The Portion of the Poor: Good News to the Poor in the Wesleyan Tradition* (Kingswood, 1995)

56 In part, this question asks an additional, more theoretical question: how and in what way does the practice of what is usually called “character ethics” provide necessary support for the organization of the broader principles of a society?

58 Kimbrough, 5